

# Meetings Requirements under the Virginia Freedom of Information Act (FOIA)

### **Contents**

6	Meetings Requirements under the Virginia Freedom of Information Act (FO	OIA). 1
26.1 Ge	eneral Provisions	
26.1.1	Duty of Public Officials to Read and Be Familiar with FOIA	3
26.1.2	What entities are covered under FOIA?	3
26.1.3	Presumption of Openness	4
26.1.4	Exemptions must be Narrowly Construed	4
26.1.5	Enforcement	4
26.1.6	Penalties	4
26.2 El	ectoral Board Meetings and Minutes	5
26.2.1	What "Meetings" Fall Under FOIA?	5
26.2.2	The Social Exception	5
26.2.3	Exceptions Allowing Electronic Participations in Electoral Board Meetings	6
26.2.4	Public Notice Requirements	7
26.2.5	Maintain Annual Notification List	8
26.2.6	Agenda Packets Are Open	9
26.2.7	Spectators May Film or Record Meeting	9
26.2.8	Minutes Are Required	
26.2.9	Votes Must Be In Open Meetings	10
26.2.10	Polling the Members	10
26.3 Cl	osed Meetings	10
26.3.1	Closed Meetings Permitted for Strictly Limited Purposes	10
26.3.2	Votes Must Be In Open Meeting	11
26.3.3	Conferences Presumed Open	11
26.3.4	Motion to Close Meeting	12
26.3.5	Closed Interviews Permitted	12
26.3.6	Discussion Restricted to Exempted Matters Covered by the Motion	12
26.3.7	Certification of closed meeting.	12
26.3.8	Nonmembers May Attend Closed Meeting	13
26.3.9	Voting Equipment and Election Security Plans	13

#### 26.1 General Provisions

The Virginia Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) was enacted in 1968 to ensure public access to state and local government meetings and records. This chapter focuses on the meetings provisions of FOIA and related election laws that particularly affect elections. The records provisions of FOIA are discussed in Chapter 6 in relationship to other sources of law. FOIA establishes a presumption of openness and defines specific exemptions that allow for the closure of meetings or withholding of records. FOIA does not direct that any meeting or records covered by its provisions be closed or withheld. It simply *allows* them to be. The choice of whether to exercise FOIA exemptions belongs to the public body or the record custodian.

Other laws may specifically direct that particular information be withheld. For example, Title 24.2 specifically directs that no social security numbers or parts thereof be open to public inspection. Other laws in Title 24.2 restrict access to particular election records. FOIA expressly provides that Title 24.2 controls access to voter registration and election records in the event of conflict. § 2.2-3703. If Title 24.2 is silent on access to a particular record, FOIA controls. No similar provision applies to meetings. FOIA generally must be followed for meetings of the State Board and electoral boards, or any subcommittee or study committee formed to advise those boards. Certain election preparation activities are not considered "meetings" based on the presence of more than one electoral board member, so long as the members do not engage in discussion or deliberation which would otherwise constitute a meeting under FOIA. § 24.2-107. Other specific exemptions exist for voting equipment security, certain equipment vendor certification submissions, and election returns SBE uses before results are announced. §§ 24.2-625.1, 24.2-629, 24.2-677. Always review carefully the specific terms of any exemption and consult legal counsel when in doubt. 2011 legislation doubles the civil penalties for which state and local government employees may be held personally responsible if a violation is found to be willful. § 2.2-3714.

FOIA was rewritten and clarified in 1999, following a two-year study that included many of the affected communities. It was then recodified, effective October 1, 2001, at which time Title 2.1 on the general administration of government became Title 2.2. The various exemptions for records were categorized and reenacted in 2004 to make them easier to find.

The Virginia Freedom of Information Advisory Council was created in 2000 to conduct training and provide advisory opinions and guidelines on FOIA. The Council has established phone numbers for those who have questions about the Act. *Contact* (804) 225-3056 or 1-866-448-4100 (toll-free). The Council's web site provides valuable reference materials on the administration of FOIA and news on training conducted by Council staff. *See* <a href="http://foiacouncil.dls.virginia.gov">http://foiacouncil.dls.virginia.gov</a>. The Virginia Municipal League also offers <a href="FOIA guidance tailored to local public bodies">FOIA guidance tailored to local public bodies</a>.

.

#### 26.1.1 Duty of Public Officials to Read and Be Familiar with FOIA

All members of the electoral board, the general registrar, and *all* employees of the registrar's and electoral board's offices are required to be familiar with how FOIA affects them. § 2.2-3702. This statute requires the local government administrator or attorney to provide new members of local public bodies a copy of FOIA within two weeks of appointment or election. All individuals should be aware that FOIA not only covers *written* documents, but also *electronic* documents, including e-mails. Care must be taken not to destroy "records" (including electronic records) that concern the transaction of public business except as directed by the appropriate <u>retention schedules</u> adopted pursuant to the Virginia Public Records Act.

For purposes of FOIA, the general registrar should be considered the "public body's administrator" unless the electoral board has its own administrative staff. Within two weeks of any board member's appointment or reappointment, the public body's administrator is required by FOIA to provide the member with a current copy of <u>The Virginia Freedom of Information Act (FOIA)</u>.

The general registrar provides the current FOIA to each electoral board member appointed or reappointed, and to new members of the registrar's office staff or the electoral board's staff. The easiest way to get a copy of the current FOIA is to print it from the FOIA Council website or use the searchable, on-line version. See <a href="http://foiacouncil.dls.virginia.gov/">http://foiacouncil.dls.virginia.gov/</a> or searchable format.

#### 26.1.2 What entities are covered under FOIA?

The three-member SBE and each three-member electoral board are "public bodies" under FOIA, and only two members are required for a quorum to conduct public business. All meetings of two or more members are covered under FOIA. Records in the possession of the Secretary and staff of the SBE, the staffs of the electoral boards, and the general registrars and their staffs are also covered by FOIA unless Title 24.2 specifically limits access to a particular type of election or voter registration record thereby overriding FOIA.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> SBE previously printed FOIA along with some of the other acts supplemental to the election laws. All such printed publications (last published in 2001) are totally outdated and should not be used. The entire Code is now available for free on the internet, and SBE no longer provides this secondary publication.

## **26.1.3** Presumption of Openness

Unless a public body, its officers or employees expressly invoke a specific exemption provided by FOIA or another statute, every meeting must be open to the public. All public meetings are presumed open, unless an exemption is properly invoked. § 2.2-3700.

#### **26.1.4** Exemptions must be Narrowly Construed

The provisions of FOIA shall be liberally construed to promote an increased awareness by all persons of governmental activities and afford every opportunity to citizens to witness the operations of government. Any exemption must be narrowly construed, and no meeting closed to the public unless specifically made exempt by FOIA or other specific law. § 2.2-3700.

#### 26.1.5 Enforcement

In any action to enforce FOIA, the public body bears the burden of proof to establish an exemption by a preponderance of the evidence. Any failure by a public body to follow the procedures established by FOIA is presumed to be a violation. § 2.2-3713. At least three working days advance notice must be given before a court petition to enforce FOIA can be filed. § 2.2-3713.

#### 26.1.6 Penalties

In a proceeding against members of public bodies, the court, if it finds that a violation was willfully and knowingly made, shall impose upon such member in his individual capacity, whether a writ of mandamus or injunctive relief is awarded or not, a civil penalty of not less than \$500 nor more than \$2,000. For a second or subsequent violation, the civil penalty shall be not less than \$2,000 or more than \$5,000. § 2.2-3714 (effective 7.1.2011). Responsible officers and staff of the public body can be liable for civil penalties. The public body can also be required to pay the requestor's attorneys' fees.

Electoral board members, registrars, and their staffs should be aware that this applies to each person individually, and that a minimum \$500 fine may be applied for "willful" violations of FOIA requirements.

# **26.2** Electoral Board Meetings and Minutes

With few exceptions, all meetings of public bodies must be open. §§ 2.2-3701, 2.2-3707, 2.2-3711. "Open meetings" or "public meetings" carry certain requirements under FOIA. See Chapter 19 for specific rules governing the electoral board canvass and consideration of provisional votes.

#### **26.2.1** What "Meetings" Fall Under FOIA?

A "Meeting" occurs any time a public body or entity sits physically, or gathers via telephonic or video equipment pursuant to § 2.2-3708, as a body or entity, or as an informal assemblage of (i) as many as three members or (ii) a quorum, if less than three constituent members are present. These types of gatherings are "meetings" regardless of their location, whether minutes are taken, and whether votes are cast. For the purposes of FOIA, "meeting" also *includes work sessions*. § 2.2-3701.

The gathering of employees of a public body shall not be deemed a meeting subject to the provisions of FOIA. § 2.2-3701.

A quorum of an electoral board is two members. The "social exemption" (described below) may cover many occasions when two or more Electoral Board members are present (for example, traveling together), but no public business is being conducted. It is best to avoid even the appearance that any public business has been discussed outside of the board's public meetings.

Two or more electoral board members may be present for the following purposes without a meeting, provided that no discussion or deliberation takes place that would otherwise constitute a meeting:

- To prepare ballots, election materials, or voting equipment
- To inspect current or potential polling places
- To train election officials (§ 24.2-107)

The exemptions may only be used to carry out the specified tasks. One electoral board member may call another member to prepare for a meeting without that being considered a meeting; the same rule applies to member of the State Board of Elections under legislation passed in 2013.

# **26.2.2** The Social Exception

Nothing in FOIA shall be construed to prohibit the gathering or attendance of two or more members of a public body (i) at any place or function where no part of the purpose of such gathering or attendance is the discussion or transaction of any public business,

and such gathering or attendance was not called or prearranged with any purpose of discussing or transacting any business of the public body, or (ii) at a public forum, candidate appearance, or debate, the purpose of which is to inform the electorate and not to transact public business or to hold discussions relating to the transaction of public business, even though the performance of the members individually or collectively in the conduct of public business may be a topic of discussion or debate at such public meeting. § 2.2-3707.

# **26.2.3** Exceptions Allowing Electronic Participations in Electoral Board Meetings

In 2007, FOIA was amended to allow members to participate in meetings electronically under certain strict circumstances (provided a quorum is still physically assembled in a public location). This provision was expanded in 2013 to allow a member of a public body to participate in a meeting by electronic communication means due to personal matter, in addition to current reasons. See 2013 HB2026 and SB1263. The new statutory language allows the member to notify the chair on or before the meeting date, allowing advance approval of the electronic participation which may not exceed two meetings or 25% of all meetings annually if greater.

Electoral boards and local boards generally may not conduct meetings to discuss or transact public business through telephonic, video, electronic, or other means of communication where the members are not physically assembled. §§ 2.2-3707, 2.2-3708.

It is important to note that specific exceptions to the electronic meetings prohibition for *state* and regional public bodies, the UVA Board of Visitors, and certain licensing proceedings will not apply to local electoral boards.

As a result of the 2013 changes, electoral board member electronic participation electronically from a remote location is authorized for the following reasons and subject to certain conditions:

- Emergency
- Personal Matter
- a temporary or permanent disability or other medical condition that prevents the member's physical attendance

The following conditions apply in all cases of electronic participation:

- On or before the day of the meeting, the member must notify the chair of the nature of the specific reason and majority approval is recorded in the minutes with the place of electronic participation; and
- A quorum (two members) is physically assembled at a public location.

• The public body must arrange for the voice of the remote participant to be heard by all persons at the primary or central meeting location. § 2.2-3708.1.

The emergency and personal matter reasons are subject to a further limitation --such participation cannot exceed two meetings in a calendar year or 25 percent of the meetings of the public body, whichever is fewer.

The prohibition on local boards holding electronic meetings (outside of the exceptions) must be considered whenever electoral board members are on the phone, as two members are a quorum. Members should use caution using the phone to avoid any discussion that would otherwise constitute a meeting.

<u>Virginia Freedom of Information Advisory Opinion 19 (2004)</u> advises that two members of a three-member electoral board may communicate using e-mail without violating FOIA, so long as it is not a simultaneous communication that would comprise a meeting for FOIA purposes (that is, it acts more like a letter than a phone call). Since such e-mails are public records, the opinion also recommends a system where all e-mails are copied to the registrar and kept on file for public inspection. If the electoral board has its own staff, they could be copied to that person for public inspection.

Interactive audio or video may be used to expand public participation. § 2.2-3708.

# **26.2.4** Public Notice Requirements

Election law requires the electoral board of each city and county to meet during the first week in February and during the month of March each year at a time set by the board and at any other time on the call of any board member. § 24.2-107. Two members constitute a quorum. Notice of each meeting must be given to all board members either by the secretary or the member calling the meeting at least three business days in advance, except in the case of an emergency. § 2.2-3701. Notice must also be given to the public. § 2.2-3707. All meetings must be conducted in accordance with the requirements of the Virginia Freedom of Information Act, except as § 24.2-107 provides for certain election preparation activities. § 2.2-3700 et seq.

There is an exception that allows electoral board members to discuss Election Day matters without formally noticing a meeting provided that "an effort has been made by all available means to give notice of the meeting to all board members." § 24.2-107. Even though this exception exists, the recommended best practice is to formally announce an Election Day meeting of the electoral board so that the public is aware that the board may be meeting to discuss issues arising that day. Suggested forms are available in the GREB

SharePoint Shared Documents Folder titled <u>FOIA Samples</u>. SBE also notices a meeting for Election Day. *See* Regulatory Town Hall and Commonwealth Calendar.

Every public body shall give notice of the date, time, and location of its meetings by placing the notice in a prominent public location at which notices are regularly posted and in the office of the clerk of the public body, or in the case of a public body which has no clerk, in the office of the chief administrator. Publication of meeting notices by electronic means is encouraged. **Notice must be posted at least three working days prior to the meeting.** § 2.2-3707.

The public notice must be posted in a public area at the registrar's or electoral board's office. It must also be posted in another prominent public location where meeting notices are normally posted. For example, a copy may be provided to the city clerk or county administrator's office to be posted on the public bulletin board there. It is not necessary to post notice at the Clerk of Court's office, but it may be used as "a prominent public location." If the locality maintains an electronic bulletin board for meeting notices (probably online, or on the local government cable access channel), that also fulfills this requirement.

Notice, reasonable under the circumstances, of special or emergency meetings must be given at the same time notice is provided to members of the public body conducting the meeting. § 2.2-3707. "Emergency" means an unforeseen circumstance rendering the notice required by FOIA impossible or impracticable and which requires immediate action. § 2.2-3701.

A meeting by the electoral board on Election Day to solve a problem which needs immediate attention is a public meeting, and the public cannot be excluded (if any public is present). However, such meetings are exempt from the public notice requirement.<sup>2</sup> § 24.2-107. Efforts must be taken, however, by all available means to give notice of the meeting to all board members. These are still "meetings," and minutes must be kept. § 24.2-107.

The State Board of Elections notices and convenes for a public meeting early on Election Day then goes into recess. This allows them to meet if needed on Election Day while fulfilling the notice requirements of FOIA.

#### 26.2.5 Maintain Annual Notification List

While public bodies are allowed to require those requesting meeting notices to annually file a written request, as a practical matter it is often easier to maintain an ongoing list

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> "Notwithstanding the public notice requirements of § 2.2-3707, two or more members of an electoral board may meet on election day to discuss a matter concerning that day's election, where such matter requires resolution on that day, and an effort has been made by all available means to give notice of the meeting to all board members." §24.2-107.

(adding or subtracting as requested). Many people will agree to receive notices by email; though if someone prefers US Mail, his/her choice must be honored.

To promote public relations, include any reporters or news outlets covering elections in the jurisdiction on the notification list.

Your local government administration may have resources to facilitate FOIA compliance such as electronic lists and calendars. Electoral board members, general registrars and staff are generally considered local government employees entitled to local support services, including legal advice on FOIA compliance affecting the local government budget. § 24.2-122.

#### 26.2.6 Agenda Packets Are Open

At least one copy of all agenda packets and, unless exempt, all materials furnished to members of a public body for a meeting must be made available for public inspection upon request at the same time these documents are furnished to the members of the public body. § 2.2-3707.

#### **26.2.7** Spectators May Film or Record Meeting

Spectators have the right to photograph, film, record, or otherwise reproduce any portion of a meeting required to be open. Public bodies cannot select meeting facilities that prohibit recording but may adopt rules governing the placement and use of equipment to prevent interference with the proceedings.<sup>3</sup> § 2.2-3707.

# 26.2.8 Minutes Are Required

Because the electoral board's minutes must be available for public inspection in either the general registrar's office or the board's office, the secretary should promptly prepare and deliver the draft minutes to that office after each meeting.<sup>4</sup> Once finalized and adopted by the board (preferably at the next meeting), the final minutes should then be promptly filed with that same office. If the board or registrar has its own website, the draft and final minutes may also be posted there.<sup>5</sup> § 24.2-107.



Minutes of the State Board of Elections are available on the Virginia Regulatory Town Hall website and the <u>Commonwealth Calendar</u>. *See* GREB 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Updated 7.1.2010.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> State boards such as SBE must post draft minutes within 10 business days. § 2.2-3707.1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The 2002 General Assembly required all *state* boards to post their minutes on the Internet. While this requirement does not currently extend to local boards, the policy preference for prompt and easily accessible minutes has been established.

### **26.2.9** Votes Must Be In Open Meetings

FOIA requires that all public business be transacted by public votes in open meetings unless a specific statutory exception applies or allows closure. For example, certain electoral board election preparation activities are not considered meetings, and certain topics such as voting equipment security may allow closing a meeting. §§ 24.2-107, 24.2-625.1. FOIA does not allow voting in secret, written ballots, or telephone polling by one board member of the others. Voting by telephone or other electronic communication is permitted only in limited emergency circumstances. § 2.2-3710; see GREB 16.2.3 (above).

#### 26.2.10 Polling the Members

The law allows individually "polling" members of a public body. However, because two electoral board members are a quorum, such "polling" cannot be done by the members. That would be a "meeting" under FOIA. If one member polled others by telephone, the polling would also be an *illegal* electronic meeting.

A common use of "polling" is for the registrar or a staff member to contact each of the board members to determine when they are available to meet before the Secretary issues the meeting notice or asks which items should go on the agenda. § 2.2-3710.

# **26.3** Closed Meetings

# **26.3.1** Closed Meetings Permitted for Strictly Limited Purposes

Public bodies may hold closed meetings only for strictly limited, enumerated purposes. § 2.2-3711. Listed below are the only purposes, of the current 29, that the State Board or electoral boards are likely to ever need. For the exact wording of the full, allowed purpose, see § 2.2-3711(A).

Public bodies may hold closed meetings only for the following purposes (the numbers below correspond to the closed meeting purposes in the law):

- (1) Discussion, consideration, or interviews of prospective candidates for employment; assignment, appointment, promotion, performance, demotion, salaries, disciplining or resignation of specific public officers, appointees or employees of any public body
- (4) The protection of the privacy of individuals in personal matters not related to public business

- (7) Consultation with legal counsel and briefings by staff members or consultants pertaining to actual or probable litigation, where such consultation or briefing in open meeting would adversely affect the negotiating or litigating posture of the public body; and consultation with legal counsel employed or retained by a public body regarding specific legal matters requiring the provision of legal advice by such counsel. For the purposes of this subdivision, "probable litigation" means litigation which has been specifically threatened or on which the public body or its legal counsel has a reasonable basis to believe will be commenced by or against a known party. Nothing in this subdivision shall be construed to permit the closure of a meeting merely because an attorney representing the public body is in attendance or is consulted on a matter
- (15) Discussion or consideration of medical and mental records excluded from this chapter [FOIA] pursuant to subdivision A 5 of § 2.2-3705
- (19) Discussion of plans to protect public safety as it relates to terrorist activity and briefings by staff members, legal counsel, or law-enforcement or emergency service officials concerning actions taken to respond to such activity or a related threat to public safety; or discussion of reports or plans related to the security of any governmental facility, building or structure, or the safety of persons using such facility, building or structure
- (35) Discussion or consideration by the State Board of Elections or local electoral boards of voting security matters made confidential pursuant to § 24.2-625.1.
  - FOIA does not require that these discussions be held in closed meetings. The board members will need to decide if a closed meeting is warranted, if allowed.

# **26.3.2** Votes Must Be In Open Meeting

To be effective, any action taken in a closed meeting must be followed by a vote in an open meeting; the substance of the action must be reasonably identified in the open meeting. § 2.2-3711.

Noncompliance with open meeting requirements in selecting public officers results in their having *de facto* officer status: their official actions are valid until they obtain notice of the legal defect in their selection. § 2.2-3711.

# **26.3.3** Conferences Presumed Open

Nothing in this section shall be construed to prevent the holding of conferences between two or more public bodies, or their representatives, but these conferences shall be subject to the same procedures for holding closed meetings that apply to any other public body. § 2.2-3711.

#### **26.3.4** Motion to Close Meeting

Any closed meeting must be "surrounded" by an open meeting. § 2.2-3712. The open meeting must be convened, with proper public notice (unless the interview exception below applies), prior to the motion being made to close the meeting. The motion must identify the subject matter, purpose, and applicable exemption for discussing that subject in a closed meeting. The motion should identify the subject matter without providing details that are the basis for closure. For sample motion, see Appendix A in the FOIA Council's guide, Access to Public Meetings.

#### 26.3.5 Closed Interviews Permitted

The notice provisions of FOIA do not apply to closed meetings of a public body held solely for the purpose of interviewing candidates for the position of "chief administrative officer" (i.e., general registrar). Prior to any such closed meeting for the purpose of interviewing candidates, the public body shall announce in an open meeting that such closed meeting shall be held at a disclosed or undisclosed location within fifteen days thereafter. § 2.2-3712.

# **26.3.6** Discussion Restricted to Exempted Matters Covered by the Motion

The public body holding a closed meeting must restrict its discussion during the closed meeting only to those matters specifically exempted from the provisions of FOIA and identified in the motion as required above. § 2.2-3712.

An open meeting with notice is required before a public body may take action on matters discussed in any closed meeting unless some specific statutory exemption applies. §§ 2.2-3707, 2.2-3712.

# 26.3.7 Certification of closed meeting

At the conclusion of any closed meeting, the public body must immediately reconvene in an open meeting and take a roll call or other recorded vote to be included in the minutes of that body, *certifying* that to the best of each member's knowledge (i) **only public business matters lawfully exempted from open meeting requirements under FOIA** and (ii) **only such public business matters as were identified in the motion by which the closed meeting was convened were heard, discussed or considered in the meeting** 

by the public body. Any member of the public body who believes that there was a departure from the requirements of subdivisions (i) and (ii), should so state prior to the vote, indicating the substance of the departure that, in his judgment, has taken place. The statement must be recorded in the minutes of the public body. § 2.2-3712.

At the end of the closed meeting, the board must immediately reconvene the open meeting. The board should send someone outside to tell anyone waiting to attend the open meeting that the meeting is reconvening. The public should be given sufficient time to reenter the room before the board proceeds to certify the closed meeting and proceed with any other business. Any agreement made, or votes taken in the closed meeting are invalid unless they are taken again in the public meeting, with their "substance reasonably identified." *See* § 2.2-3711 and GREB 26.3.2 (above).

#### **26.3.8** Nonmembers May Attend Closed Meeting

A public body may permit nonmembers to attend a closed meeting if such persons are deemed necessary or if their presence will reasonably aid the public body in its consideration of a topic that is a subject of the meeting. § 2.2-3712. It is recommended that permission for such nonmembers to remain in the room during the closed meeting be stated in the motion to close the meeting.

## **26.3.9** Voting Equipment and Election Security Plans

Certain State Board or electoral board meetings and records concerning voting equipment and election security may be closed. However, records may only be excluded from inspection and copying, and meetings may only be closed under both of the following conditions:

- Records or discussions in meetings describe protocols for maintaining the security of ballots or voting and counting equipment, *or* reveal the results of risk assessments of specific local electoral procedures.
- The release of such records or discussion of such matters in an open meeting would compromise the security of an election.

This exemption specifically states that it does not authorize a closed meeting to discuss any breach of security in an election. §§ 24.2-625.1 and 2.2-3711(35).